

**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday,
18th November 2003 at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,
Michael Cameron St. John Birt, Esquire.**

All members were present with the exception of –

Senator Paul Vincent Le Claire– out of the Island
Senator Christopher Gerard Pellow Lakeman – out of the Island
Kenneth Priaux Vibert, Connétable of St. Ouen- ill
Jacqueline Jeannette Huet, Deputy of St. Helier– out of the Island
Terence John Le Main, Deputy of St. Helier– out of the Island

Prayers

Earl and Countess of Wessex – message of congratulations

The Deputy Bailiff informed the Assembly that the following message had been sent to the Earl and Countess of Wessex on the birth of their daughter –

“The Lieutenant-Governor, Bailiff, States and people of Jersey, recalling with great affection your recent visit to the Island, join together to send Your Royal Highnesses their warmest congratulations on the occasion of the birth of your daughter on Saturday 8th November 2003. We pray that she will be blessed with health and happiness, and that you will together share the joys of family life.”

Welcome – Miss Elizabeth Watson, Head of Committee Office, Scottish Parliament

The Deputy Bailiff, on behalf of all members, welcomed to the States Miss Elizabeth Watson, Head of Committee Office, Scottish Parliament.

Matters presented

The following matters were presented to the States –

Official Report of the States Assembly and its Committees (‘Hansard’): Introduction (P.81/2003) – comments. <i>Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.</i>	P.81/2003. Com.
States of Jersey Law 1966, as amended: delegation of functions – Public Finances (General) (Jersey) Rules 1967, as amended. <i>Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.</i>	R.C.48/2003.
Benefits paid by the Housing and Employment and Social Security Committees: protection (P.116/2003) – comments. <i>Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.</i>	P.116/2003. Com.(3)
Social Security Fund: a new method of funding (P.137/2003) – comments. <i>Presented by the Employment and Social Security Committee.</i>	P.137/2003. Com.

THE STATES ordered that the said reports be printed and distributed.

Matters noted – land transactions

THE STATES noted Acts of the Finance and Economics Committee dated 5th and 12th November 2003, showing that, in pursuance of Standing Orders relating to certain transactions in land, the Committee had approved –

5th November 2003

As recommended by the Harbours and Airport Committee, the lease to Condor (Jersey) Limited of ground floor and first floor offices, storeroom and toilets (E1, E22 and E23) situated in the Passenger Terminal at Elizabeth Harbour, St. Helier, for a further term of nine years at a total annual rent of £49,345.05, from 1st April 2003, to be reviewed annually in line with the Jersey Retail Price Index.

12th November 2003

- (a) As recommended by the Health and Social Services Committee, the lease to Jersey Telecom Group Limited of a services distribution (or CAB) room at Sandybrook Hospital, St. Lawrence (in order to formalise the lease agreement following the incorporation of the Telecommunications Board), for a period of 99 years, deemed to have commenced from 3rd April 2000, for an initial capital sum of £9,000 and nominal annual rent of £10 without review thereafter, on the basis of the Heads of Terms outlined in the original report, dated 2nd December 1999, and as approved by the Director of Property Services;
- (b) as recommended by the Health and Social Services Committee, the lease to Mr. Michael Paul Norman of the two-bedroom property Flat 1, Le Boulevard, La Grande Route des Sablons, Grouville, for a period of six years deemed to have commenced from 25th March 2003, at an initial annual rent of £8,891 subject to phased increases of 10% with effect from 24th June 2003 to 2006, thereafter subject to annual review in accordance with the Jersey Retail Price Index, on the basis that each party would be responsible for its own legal costs arising from the transaction;
- (c) as recommended by the Health and Social Services Committee, the lease to Miss Irene Elizabeth Measures of the three-bedroom property Flat 4, Le Boulevard, La Grande Route des Sablons, Grouville for a period of six years deemed to have commenced from 24th June 2003, at an initial annual rent of £9,780 subject to phased increases of 10% with effect from 24th June 2004 to 2006, thereafter subject to annual review in accordance with the Jersey Retail Price Index, on the basis that each party would be responsible for its own legal costs arising from the transaction; and,
- (d) as recommended by the Harbours and Airport Committee, the entering into of a Deed of Arrangement with Mr. Jonathan David Stuttard and Miss Ronnie Dawn Jubb in order to clarify the boundary between the airfield at Jersey Airport adjacent to the rear car park of the Fuel Compound and the property known as Laburnum Farm, Le Mont à la Brune, St. Peter, on the basis that Mr. Stuttard and Miss Jubb would erect a fence to which they would be granted reasonable access via the said car park, and with the said owners being responsible for both parties' legal costs arising from this transaction.

Matters noted – acceptance of tender

THE STATES noted an Act of the Finance and Economics Committee dated 5th November 2003, showing that, in pursuance of Rule 5 of the Public Finances (General) (Jersey) Rules 1967, as amended, the Committee had noted that the Environment and Public Services Committee had accepted a tender in respect of the proposed relining of the Le Bourg rising main by Insituform technologies Limited in the sum of £235,566.30, for which sufficient funds were available in Vote C0418– Sewer Reconstruction.

Matters lodged

The following matters were lodged “au Greffe” –

Draft Finance (Jersey) Law 200-. <i>Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.</i>	P.158/2003.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment No. 23) (Jersey) Law 200-. <i>Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.</i>	P.159/2003.
Budget 2004: amendment. <i>Presented by the Deputy of St. John.</i>	P.160/2003.
Le Coie Hotel site, Janvrin Road/Springfield Road, St. Helier: approval of drawings and sale of units. <i>Presented by the Housing Committee.</i>	P.161/2003.
Dental Department: relocation. <i>Presented by the Health and Social Services Committee.</i>	P.162/2003.
Belle Vue Residential Nursing Home and Day Care Centre, St. Brelade: business case. <i>Presented by the Connétable of St. Helier, and referred to the Health and Social Services Committee.</i>	P.163/2003.
Code of Practice on Public Access to Official Information: measures to improve implementation. <i>Presented by the Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	P.164/2003.
Budget 2004: second amendment. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.165/2003.
Budget 2004: third amendment. <i>Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.</i>	P.166/2003.

Arrangement of public business for the next meeting on 25th November 2003

THE STATES adopted a proposition of Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur that the proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier concerning Benefits paid by the Housing and the Employment and Social Security Committees: protection, (P.116/2003 lodged “au Greffe” on 29th July 2003), be not considered on 25th November 2003.

Members present voted as follows –

“Pour” (26)

Senators

Norman, Walker, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf.

Connétables

St. Martin, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Peter, Trinity, St. Lawrence, Grouville.

Deputies

Trinity, Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Troy(B), Voisin(L), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Rya (H), Taylor(C).

“Contre” (19)

Senators

Le Maistre, Syvret, Kinnard, E. Vibert.

Connétables

St. Clement, St. Helier.

Deputies

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), St. Martin, Baudains(C), Scott Warren(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Martin(H Southern(H), Grouville, St. Peter, Hilton(H), De Faye(H).

THE STATES adopted a proposition of Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur that the proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier concerning Income Tax: introduction of higher rate, (P.131/2003 lodged “au Greffe” on 9th September 2003), be not considered on 25th November 2003.

Members present voted as follows –

“Pour” (24)

Senators

Norman, Walker, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf.

Connétables

St. Martin, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Peter, Trinity, St. Lawrence, Grouville.

Deputies

Trinity, St. John, Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Voisin(L), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Ryε (H), Taylor(C).

“Contre” (22)

Senators

Le Maistre, Syvret, Kinnard, E. Vibert.

Connétables

St. Mary, St. John, St. Clement, St. Helier.

Deputies

Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), St. Martin, Baudains(C), Troy(B), Scott Warren(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H Martin(H), Southern(H), Grouville, St. Peter, Hilton(H), De Faye(H).

THE STATES confirmed that the following matters lodged “au Greffe” would be considered at the next meeting on 25th November 2003 –

Draft Road Traffic (No. 55) (Jersey) Regulations 200. P.157/2003.
Lodged: 11th November 2003.
Deputy of St. Martin.

States Members’ remuneration: abolition of means testing. P.145/2003.
Lodged: 21st October 2003.

Privileges and Procedures Committee.

States Members' remuneration: abolition of means testing (P.145/2003) – P.145/2003.
comments. Com.

Presented: 11th November 2003.

Employment and Social Security Committee.

States Members' remuneration: establishment of an Independent Review Body. P.146/2003.

Lodged: 21st October 2003.

Privileges and Procedures Committee.

Draft Road Traffic (No. 54) (Jersey) Regulations 200. P.151/2003.

Lodged: 4th November 2003.

Home Affairs Committee.

Jersey 65+ Health Plan. P.153/2003.

Lodged: 11th November 2003.

Employment and Social Security Committee.

Planning and Building (Jersey) Law 2002 – removal of third party appeals – P.206/2002

THE STATES noted that, in pursuance of Standing Order 17(6), the following matter lodged “au Greffe” had been withdrawn –

Planning and Building (Jersey) Law 2002 – removal of third party appeals. P.206/2002.

Lodged: 5th November 2002.

Environment and Public Services Committee.

(Lodged in the name of the former Planning and Environment Committee).

The future funding of school milk – question and answer (Tape No. 869)

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier asked Deputy Francis Gerald Voisin of St. Lawrence, President of the Economic Development Committee, the following question –

“Would the President advise members what steps the Committee has taken to secure, from the Finance and Economics Committee, additional funding for the years 2004 and 2005 to maintain the provision of free school milk and what response has been received from that Committee?”

The President of the Economic Development Committee replied in the following terms –

“The Committee discussed the funding of school milk at its meeting held on 29th October 2003. It was agreed that funds for 2004 should be requested from the Finance and Economics Committee; however, before doing so, the Department's officers are establishing whether there will be an under-spend in 2003 that could be used to fund or part fund the cost of school milk for 2004.

The Committee has agreed to make a growth bid as part of the Fundamental Spending Review process for 2005.”

Tax allowances for wealthy residents, the proposed introduction of sales tax and PAYE – question and answer (Tape No. 869)

Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier asked Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur, President of the Finance and Economics Committee, the following question –

“Will the President inform members in relation to the reduction of tax allowances for wealthy residents, the introduction of sales tax, and PAYE –

- (a) when the Committee expects to finalise its proposals in respect of each of these matters?
- (b) how much additional revenue the Committee expects to raise by each of these three measures?

and

- (c) whether each of these three measures will be ready for implementation in 2005?”

The President of the Finance and Economics Committee replied in the following terms –

- “(a) As the Budget Book 2004 made clear, the Committee intends to launch a consultation next year on the proposals to phase out allowances for those with pre-tax income of £80,000 or more. I do not wish to pre-empt the results of that consultation period but I can confirm that it is the Committee’s intention to introduce legislation in next year’s Budget which may take effect from the year of assessment 2005.

In relation to PAYE, the Committee’s aim in the short term is to bring in a simplified form of PAYE relating to the construction industry, as introducing a system across the board would be much more complicated and have considerable staff and resources consequences at the Income Tax Office. I also ought to make it quite clear that PAYE is not a solution for the problem that will face us in 2009 but that it is something we are looking at to further increase equity in the tax system and for reasons of good governance. However, we must not lose sight of the fact that any form of PAYE puts a considerable administrative burden on employers, who will effectively be acting as unpaid tax collectors. PAYE needs consideration and careful thought but I anticipate a decision being made early next year.

As members will be aware, the Island faces a potential taxation revenue shortfall of up to £80-£100 million in the coming years. In addressing this issue the Committee is currently considering various packages of tax reform measures. Much research work is currently being undertaken and it is hoped that the results from this work will be available early in the new year, soon after which we hope to present a range of options, including the Committee’s preferred tax reform ‘package’, for consideration.

- (b) It is estimated that reducing and removing allowances for those with pre-tax income of £80,000 or more would generate approximately £8 million. It is estimated that a simplified form of PAYE relating to the construction industry would generate between £1 and £2 million whilst a comprehensive PAYE system could yield up to £5 million.

With regards to the potential revenue generated from the possible introduction of a sales tax, I wish to emphasise that no decisions have yet been taken on the package of tax reform measures to be proposed. In terms of the potential revenue a sales tax could raise, this could be anything from zero to up to £100 million depending, of course, on the rate of the sales tax to be applied. The gross yield would be in the region of £8.5 million per 1% depending on the level of exemptions, such as food and children’s clothes.

The Committee does not believe, however, that a single measure, particularly one such as a sales tax/VAT, should be used in isolation to raise the possible tax revenue shortfall. As I have previously stated, the Committee believes that a ‘package’ of tax reform measures is preferable.

- (c) It is expected that the proposal to reduce and remove allowances could be ready for implementation at the very earliest for the year of assessment 2005 and yield additional tax revenues in 2006.

The earliest date that a simplified form of PAYE could be introduced, because of all the significant administrative, operational and resource consequences of such a system, would be from 1st January 2006.

Should a sales tax be proposed as part of a 'package' of tax reform measures it could not be ready for implementation during 2005. The possible introduction of a sales tax would require a lead time for introduction of between 3 and 4 years.”

Matters relating to the Assisted House Purchase Scheme – questions and answers (Tape No. 689)

The Deputy of St. John asked the Deputy of Trinity, Vice-President of the Housing Committee, the following questions –

- “1. Would the Vice-President give details of the property transaction involving the States concerning the acquisition of 3 Les Buttes, St. Martin under the Assisted House Purchase Scheme for the sum of £265,000 in view of this being in the first-time buyer range?”
2. Would the Vice-President advise whether the Committee will be bringing proposals to the States for debate regarding a review of the Assisted House Purchase Scheme, and, if so, when?”

The Vice-President of the Housing Committee replied as follows –

- “1. The lower limit for acquisitions of freehold houses for occupation by 1(1)(j) category employees is £250,000. Although many 1(1)(j) category acquisitions are at a price well above this figure there is nothing extraordinary about this acquisition and it reflects the fact that not all 1(1)(j) category employees have very high incomes.
2. The Committee has noted the concern of some members that, under the Assisted House Purchase Scheme, the States has on behalf of 1(1)(j) category employees purchased a significant number of properties. I am pleased to report that the Committee has approved an alternative approach to home ownership for (j) category employees and therefore will not be bringing forward any new proposals for the Assisted House Purchase Scheme to the States for debate.

I can advise that the arrangement whereby the States was required to purchase all dwellings on behalf of permanent 1(1)(j) category employees where those employees wished to enjoy an equity share in the property, has ceased with effect from 1st October 2003. Following advice from the Law Officers’ Department, States’ 1(1)(j) employees are now permitted to purchase through the means of a company of which they are the beneficial owner. Employees with existing loans through the Assisted House Purchase Scheme will be permitted to continue with those loans or alternatively opt to switch to the new scheme. These changes have been made after consultation and with the agreement of the Education, Sport and Culture, Health and Social Services and Human Resources Departments.

The new arrangement overcomes any difficulties that might arise should the individual employee purchase in their own name prior to completing 10 years as an essential employee and then leave that employment. Full details of the new policy are posted on the States Human Resources internet and intranet sites.”

Matters relating to Emeraude Lines and the Jersey-St. Malo ferry route– questions and answers (Tape No. 689)

Senator Edward Philip Vibert asked Senator Leonard Norman, President of the Harbours and Airport Committee the following questions –

- “1. During the ‘no confidence’ debate on 5th November 2003, the President informed the States that under the Service Level Agreement there was no requirement for Emeraude Lines to operate two vessels. Would the President confirm that the Service Level Agreement did in fact contain this requirement, and, if so, would he agree that this could be described as misleading members?”

2. Following his statement to the Assembly on 11th November 2003, does the President accept that he mislead members regarding the insurance of Solidor V in answering questions on 5th November 2003, and would he now consider resigning?
3. Would the President inform members whether the £300,000 owed to the States is ever likely to be paid, and, if not, whether the seizure of Solidor V served any purpose?
4. Will the President inform members whether the Committee can refuse a ramp licence to whoever takes over Emeraude Lines for the St. Malo-St. Helier route in view of legal advice the Committee has received?"

The President of the Harbours and Airport Committee replied as follows –

- “1. The Service Level Agreement with Emeraude Lines signed in 1999 and cancelled in 2002 was, I am advised, created at the request of the company.

The company had made the decision to use two vessels because, I understand, it wished to travel to and from Guernsey and St. Malo as well as Jersey and St. Malo. Also, as the route was continuing to grow, it required two vessels to increase its capacity on the route.

The Committee had no power, vires or authority to require the company to operate two vessels, therefore the statement made by me during the debate, which was that the Committee did not require the company to operate two vessels, was correct as the requirement was that of the company, not the Committee.

2. No and no.
3. My belief at this time is that the monies due to the States are likely to be paid.
4. Yes.”

New Chairman of the Waterfront Enterprise Board – statement

Senator Frank Harrison Walker, President of the Policy and Resources Committee made a statement in the following terms –

“I would like to bring States members up to date on the arrangements for the appointment of a new Chairman of the Waterfront Enterprise Board.

Members will recall that on 23rd July 2003, the States approved a report and proposition of the Policy and Resources Committee entitles ‘Waterfront Enterprise Board: Re-appointment of Members’, (P.103/2003), and decided to appoint Jurat John Tibbo and Mr. Peter Crespel as non-States Directors of the Waterfront Enterprise Board Limited for a period of three years expiring on 20th August 2006. The States also agreed to appoint Jurat Tibbo as Chairman of the Board for a three month period expiring on 19th November 2003.

Since that time the Policy and Resources Committee has sought the views of the Appointments Commission on the process to be adopted for the recruitment and selection of a new Chairman. The comments of the Appointments Commission have now been received and these will be considered by the Policy and Resources Committee when it meets later this week. As soon as the Committee has reached a decision on this matter, a press release will be issued to inform States members and the public of the process that has been agreed.

Once a suitable candidate has been identified, the Committee intends to lodge a report and proposition early in the New Year to seek the approval of the States to the appointment.

In the meantime, and pending this appointment, I am pleased to report that Jurat Tibbo has agreed to stay on as Chairman on a temporary basis. The Committee is extremely grateful to Jurat Tibbo for his work as Chairman over the last three months, and for having agreed to remain on in this capacity until a more permanent appointment is made.”

Revisions to the Connex Bus network – statement

Deputy Maurice Françoise Dubras of St. Lawrence, President of the Environment and Public Services Committee made a statement in the following terms –

“The Environment and Public Services Committee, as regulator, received a presentation from Connex Transport Jersey Limited on 7th November 2003, for proposed revisions to the Island’s public bus network following its first year’s operation and based on the outcome from its survey of both bus users and the general public carried out during August 2003.

In a statement I made to the Assembly earlier this year, I advised members that we would be moving away from the traditional winter and summer timetables and instead would be prepared to consider proposed changes to the network as they were identified at various times during the year. Any suggested changes would only be implemented following a period of consultation. Members will recall that some small changes were made in September 2003, and the advertisement that will appear in the Jersey Evening Post tonight outlines proposals for implementation in January 2004. They incorporate some of the findings resulting from the year one operation and the survey.

These proposals involve some significant changes to the old network, the overall purpose of which is to provide a better balance of service and use of resources directed to those areas containing the larger proportions of the population. In addition, these changes allow the Committee to implement the first phase of integrating as much of the school bus service into the public service as possible.

The proposals now are for a new core year-round network. The intention remains to provide some service enhancements during the summer. The addition of tourist-focused summer services is currently being planned and will be the subject of consultation with the Tourism industry as soon as it can be arranged, the aim being to introduce a variety of changes at appropriate times in the year.

Meanwhile, as part of the present public consultation process, the advertisement will give a broad view of where proposed service levels increase or reduce or in some cases would be curtailed. Connex will publish more detailed information in due course which will be made available at their Weighbridge offices and at all Parish Halls. The advertisement provides addresses to which written submissions are invited from the public and affected organisations representing certain customer groups. These submissions will need to arrive by 11th December 2003, at the latest.

Before the Environment and Public Services Committee authorises any changes it will take into account all written representations received during the consultation period. When approved, the resulting timetable will be introduced in the New Year at a date to be notified.

The Committee’s report on the combined operations of the school bus service and the public bus service is now due to be published early in December 2003 following the next scheduled Committee meeting.”

Proposed Ratification of the International Convention for Safety of Life at Sea, 1974 and Implementation of the Associated International Ship and Port Security Code – P.144/2003 Comments – P.144/2003: comments, comments (2)

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Harbours and Airport Committee –

(a) requested the Bailiff to inform the Secretary of State and Lord Chancellor that it was the wish of the

Insular Authorities that the International Convention for Safety of Life at Sea 1974, and its subsequent protocols and amendments, be ratified on behalf of the Island;

(b) charged the Harbours and Airport Committee –

- (i) to bring forward for approval by the States the necessary legislation to give legal effect to the said Convention and to enable the Shipping (Jersey) Law 2002 to come into force;
- (ii) to carry out all necessary security work at the ports of Jersey so that the International Ship and Port Security Code might be implemented on 1st July 2004; and,
- (iii) to agree arrangements with the appropriate United Kingdom authorities to ensure that the proper international standards were satisfied for the Island to meet its obligations under the Convention and in particular the International Ship and Port Security Code.

Jersey Law Commission: appointment of Chairman and Commissioner – P.147/2003

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Legislation Committee, referred to their Act, dated 30th July 1996, in which they approved the establishment of a Jersey Law Commission, and appointed Mr. David Lyons as Chairman and Advocate Kerry Joy Lawrence as Commissioner for a period of 5 years with effect from 19th November 2003.

Southview, La Route des Genets, St. Brelade: purchase– P.148/2003

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Health and Social Services Committee concerning the purchase of Southview, La Route des Genets, St. Brelade, and after discussion, rejected a proposition of the Connétable of St. Helier that the matter be referred back to the Committee.

Members present voted as follows on the reference back –

“Pour” (3)

Connétables

St. Helier.

Deputies

Duhamel(S), De Faye(H).

“Contre” (42)

Senators

Syvret, Norman, Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf, E. Vibert.

Connétables

St. Martin, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Peter, St. Clement, Trinity, St. Lawrence, Grouville.

Deputies

Trinity, Breckon(S), St. Martin, St. John, Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Troy(B), Voisin(L), Scott Warren(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Bridge(H), Martin(H), Southern(H), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mary, St. Ouen, Ryan(H), Taylor(C), Grouville, St. Peter, Hilton(H).

THE STATES resumed consideration of the matter and adopting the proposition of the Health and Social Services Committee –

- (a) authorised the purchase from Mrs. Carole Dawn Valente, née Chapman, of the property known as ‘Southview’, La Route des Genets, St. Brelade, as shown on Drawing No. 1974/03/65, for the sum of £540,000, with each party being responsible for its own legal fees in relation to the transaction;
- (b) authorised the Attorney General and the Greffier of the States to pass, on behalf of the public, any contracts which might be found necessary to pass in connection with the said property; and,
- (c) authorised the payment or discharge of the expenses to be incurred in connection with the acquisition of the said property, and all interests therein, from the Environment and Public Services Committee vote of credit ‘Acquisition of Land – Major Reserve’ (Vote C0904).

Members present voted as follows –

“Pour” (43)

Senators

Syvret, Norman, Walker, Kinnard, Le Sueur, Routier, M. Vibert, Ozouf, E. Vibert.

Connétables

St. Martin, St. Saviour, St. Brelade, St. Mary, St. John, St. Peter, St. Clement, St. Helier, Tri
St. Lawrence, Grouville.

Deputies

Trinity, Duhamel(S), Breckon(S), St. Martin, St. John, Dubras(L), Dorey(H), Troy(B), Voisin(L),
Scott Warren(S), Le Hérissier(S), Fox(H), Bridge(H), Martin(H), Bernstein(B), Ferguson(B), St. Mar
Ryan(H), Taylor(C), Grouville, St. Peter, Hilton(H), De Faye(H).

“Contre” (1)

Deputies

St. Ouen.

Fundamental Spending Review Process – (as Committee of the Whole House)

THE STATES, in accordance with their decision of 4th November 2003, resolved into a Committee of the Whole House in accordance with Standing Order 38A for the purpose of discussing the Fundamental Spending Review Process of the Finance and Economics Committee.

THE STATES, in pursuance of Standing Order 38B(1), noted the appointment of Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur, President of the Finance and Economics Committee, by the Deputy Bailiff to act as chairman of the Committee of the Whole House and in pursuance of Standing Order 38B(5), noted the attendance of the Treasurer of the States during the discussion.

THE STATES rose at 5.30 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States.